Barriers to Improving Service Delivery in Malaysian Hotels: Experts’ views on a proposed model

Keywords
Service quality, six sigma, internal marketing, employee remuneration, loyalty.

Abstract
Tourism is central to economic prosperity in a number of developing countries with many reliant on the industry as a major catalyst for growth and development. In Malaysia, for example, the tourism industry makes a significant contribution to GDP; however, the Malaysian tourism industry is developing rapidly within an era of increasing competition. While the industry comprises a number of well-appointed hotels, service delivery lags behind the physical hotel environment often struggling to meet the expectations of international guests. This study set out to develop a customised service improvement model to support the growing industry in Malaysia by extracting the most appropriate service improvement dimensions from existing, empirically tested models found within the literature. In line with recent services studies, the model developed placed strong focus on human resource management and development with an emphasis on employee satisfaction. Qualitative research was then used to establish whether key stakeholders in the Malaysian tourism sector could identify barriers to the implementation of the model and to the improvement of service delivery within Malaysian hotels. The results confirm that an appropriate service delivery improvement model for the Malaysian hotel sector needs to concentrate on dimensions that attract, train, motivate and retain employees. Among the most significant barriers to service improvement emerging out of the research was the issue of employee remuneration.

Introduction
Tourism makes a significant contribution to the economies of many countries with some countries reliant on the industry as a major catalyst for growth and development. In Malaysia, for example, the tourism industry is second only to the manufacturing sector in terms of contribution to GDP (Ministry of Finance/Central Bank of Malaysia 2010). However, the Malaysian tourism industry is developing rapidly within an era of increasing competition (Annual Tourism Statistical Report 2009). While the industry comprises a number of high quality hotels, service delivery lags behind the physical hotel environment, often struggling to meet the expectations of international guests (Lau, et al. 2005). Consequently, the aims of this study were to develop a customised service delivery model to improve service delivery within the Malaysian hotel industry. By developing a model for the improvement of service quality to a level where customers are enticed to visit and revisit, the industry in Malaysia can be positioned as a superior tourist destination. The research set out to evaluate the appropriateness of the proposed model with key stakeholders in the Malaysian Tourism Industry and modify the model to suit local context and conditions.

Background and research framework
There are a raft of views within the literature on how to improve service delivery standards. These views permeate the management and marketing literature and are generally consistent in relation to how to improve service but scholars are divided on the outcomes of service quality. The main arguments relate to whether achieving consistently high levels of service can develop customer loyalty (Fullerton 2005; O’Mahony et al. 2013). Notwithstanding the distinction between satisfaction and loyalty, there is general agreement among scholars that there is a significant relationship between employee performance and customer satisfaction (Arnett et al. 2002; Berry & Parasuraman, 1991; Parasuraman et al. 1985). Service sector researchers in particular have recognised that businesses that develop motivated, customer conscious employees achieve better service outcomes because employees who do not have confidence in the service that they are required to deliver are incapable of delivering services in a manner that meets or exceeds customer expectations (Berry, et al.1976; Berry, 1981; Grönroos, 1983). However, by attracting, motivating, and retaining qualified personnel and by providing service tools designed to satisfy their wants and needs, organisations can develop a commitment to their mission and goals (Berry 1981; Grönroos 1983). In this way, internal employee relationships pave the way to building external customer relationships that, in turn, lead to long term commitment by customers to the organization (Bowen & Shoemaker, 2003). As a result, when designing a model to improve service quality within the Malaysian hotel sector, it would seem prudent to concentrate on human resource dimensions and then validate that model by eliciting the views of expert stakeholders from important bodies within or associated with the Malaysian hospitality sector.

The review of literature uncovered a number of quality improvement models from which an appropriate model for the Malaysian hotel sector could be fashioned. A plethora of models were reviewed; however, only those models that had been empirically tested were deemed appropriate to include in the study. Among these were; Total Quality Management (TQM), Six Sigma, SERVQUAL, the Relationship Marketing paradigm, Internal Marketing and Internal Market Orientation (Gournaris 2008; O’Mahony et al. 2013; Powell 1995; Ravichandran 2006; Shamji 2005; Sureshchandar 2001; Thawani 2004). Each of these was reviewed and it was found that there were a combined total of 240 dimensions that were seen to have an impact on service delivery. Consequently, those dimensions that were more appropriate to non-service settings such as manufacturing were omitted and the most common service dimensions from each model were further examined with a particular emphasis on those dimensions that focussed on employees and employee development. This led to the development of a provisional model containing the 18 dimensions depicted in Figure 1. The model consisted of three primary dimensions and a number of sub dimensions.
In analysing the factors critical to service improvement, however, it was clear that geographic and demographic factors along with type of industry, field of previous studies and study orientation should also be considered because implementation of service improvement models in different environments could lead to different outcomes. Consequently, the views of key local stakeholders were critical to explore whether the model was indeed appropriate for the Malaysian hotel sector, whether it was likely to improve service delivery within that sector and whether there were any perceived barriers to the adoption of the model.

In order to answer these questions, the researchers employed qualitative research techniques to gain rich insights from key experts. Respondents were, therefore, selected on the basis of the insights and perspective they could provide and thus it was important that a broad range of stakeholders was included (Minichiello et al. 1995). In Malaysia, service improvement within the hotel sector is an important goal of many government, public and private agencies. For example, the Ministry for Tourism is responsible for increasing tourist numbers and tourism related revenue across the State, while the Ministry for Labour (Human Resources) is responsible for human resource development, remuneration and general working conditions within the State. Universities and colleges are responsible for preparing students for positions in the industry and in the private sector and hotel operators are responsible for hospitality operations and employees. As a result, an expert who could provide a view from each of these perspectives was included in the sample and each of these experts was recruited to take part in an in-depth interview. The sampling profile is presented in Table 1.
Table 1 Sample profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th>Number of Respondents</th>
<th>Five Star Hotels</th>
<th>Four Star Hotels</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Tourism</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Human Resources</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospitality and Tourism Educators</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Manager</td>
<td>1 1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resources Manager</td>
<td>1 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>4 2 2 2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A semi-structured interview schedule was developed to guide the collection of the data. This level of structure was appropriate because according to Marshall and Rossman (1995) overly structured interviews limit emerging ideas and opinions, which means the essence of the interview could be lost. During the interviews, each dimension was briefly discussed and respondents were then requested to comment on each dimension of the model and advise on its suitability for the Malaysian Hotel Sector. Respondents were also invited to discuss any other issues or inputs considered valuable to improve service delivery within the Malaysian Hotel Sector. In other words, to omit or add dimensions to the proposed model which they considered to be significant to improving service delivery within Malaysian hotels.

Respondents were then asked to discuss service quality within the Malaysian hotel sector and to identify any barriers that might hinder service improvement or the adoption of the model.

Results

The interviews were transcribed and coded, categorising topics and themes by using the headings in the interview schedule as a first step, and then allowing for emerging themes to develop in a systematic process. The length of each interview varied with the shortest interview being 40 minutes and the longest recorded as 1 hour and 45 minutes.

The first topic discussed by these key stakeholders was what evolved to be an emotive, multi-pronged issue on compensation or the remuneration system currently in place in the Malaysian Hotel sector. Within all eight interviews it was found that respondents had strong views on this issue and believed that it had the most influence on service quality and, more importantly, service quality improvement. In general, these experts agreed that hotel employees in Malaysia are underpaid and poorly compensated for their work. This was explained when the context of the industry was discussed at the beginning of each interview and also in relation to the dimensions of the service improvement model. As the interviews progressed, it became clear that the human factors or employees are critical to improving current service provision and to the future of the hospitality industry. This confirmed the importance of the human resource related dimensions of the service improvement model.

Monetary compensation was seen as the most significant issue because the experts believed that one reason that hotel employees decide not to further their employment in the industry is
because they find jobs in other industries that pay better salaries. In contrast, however, one expert felt that some hotel employees were overpaid compared to employees in other industries. This, however, was the extreme rather than the collective view.

One of the experts also suggested that salary is one of the most important motivators for employees to perform better, but felt that the issue was not given sufficient attention by the Government or hotel operators. One of the experts explained that a fair compensation system is paramount to improving service delivery. Another expert explained that the ultimate way to improve service delivery within the hotel industry in Malaysia was to pay good salaries to hotel employees. He added that the majority of hotel operators in Malaysia fail to deploy proper Human Resource Management Practices related to compensation. He also asserted that many highly qualified graduates choose not to work in the industry due to poor remuneration.

Respondents also expressed the view that the majority of hotel operators assume that the function of hotel employees is to work and to execute tasks rather than to develop relationships with guests, or any of the other important tasks that are within the mandate of empowered workers. Respondents felt that they (hotel operators) were of the view that hotel employees are paid a salary and they should perform any tasks assigned to them, which is in keeping with the view of human resource management that sees employees as an input to be exploited rather than a resource to be developed. The issue of remuneration, however, emerged to be extremely complex as the views and quotes expressed in the following sections show.

One consequence of low salary levels was that many hotel employees were reported to live under the poverty level. This claim was made on the basis that many rank and file employees are paid less than MYR 500 (basic salary) per month. As one respondent explained:

In Malaysia if the total of household income is below MYR 500 you are considered under the poverty level. For an argument how rank and file hotel employees could survive with MYR 400 basic salaries in a month. In general MYR 500 ringgit minimum wages is practiced by hotels in Malaysia right now … (Expert 2).

He went on to explain that “… at the moment, most hotel employees are being paid under the poverty level” and this expert strongly suggested it was crucial to review the hotel employee salary system not only to improve service but to assist in developing the skills needed to support the growing tourism industry.

The majority of experts proposed that a minimum wage for hotel employees should be introduced within the hotel industry. They felt that to have a minimum wage in place would eliminate a number of current industry problems such as ‘job hopping’ and employee turnover. They also contended that this strategy would help the industry to improve service delivery. One issue that was raised as a demotivating influence for rank and file hotel employees was that management level employees enjoy a good base salary compared to lower level employees. Management also enjoyed longer vacations and a variety of other benefits that are not available to lower level employees. The experts felt that this is unfair, because lower ranking hotel employees are the back-bone of the industry and work extremely hard.
One of the experts also felt that the working environment, including the hours and job conditions, were not acceptable to hotel employees. Another respondent expressed the view that even if hotel employees were paid a good salary, they would certainly resign if they received a better offer from another hotel. This expert was of the view that there is no sense of loyalty among hotel employees; however, other respondents argued that hotel operators should have good employee retention strategies to overcome this problem.

Another issue of compensation perceived to be important to the delivery of quality service was competition to employ the best talent to work in the hotel industry. One of the experts explained that hotels that have the capacity to pay a good salary are able to attract the best talent, but many highly talented hotel employees in Malaysia were also offered better salaries and benefits from other countries such as The United Arabs Emirates, Taiwan, and Hong Kong. This was seen as a serious problem for hotel school graduates, given the state investment in education which was then lost to Malaysia.

One of the experts also explained that uncontrolled hotel development has an adverse impact on the quality of service delivery as well as salary levels. That expert explained that when there are too many hotel rooms available in the Malaysian market, the need to employ more employees’ increases. This creates a competitive employment market and salaries increase, pushing up overall costs. Employing untrained employees was proposed as a better option because they accept lower salaries. Thus, it was perceived that the quality of service delivery could be jeopardised by the addition of new hotels to the market.

One issue that emerged that has a direct impact on the compensation structure was that, under the Malaysian National Wage Act 1960, service charge (points system) payments made to hotel employees are not considered as salary. This is apparently because legislators are aware that the total amount of service charge varies from month to month. However, under the Malaysian Employment Act 1995, the remuneration from service charge is considered as salary. This issue has confused many hotel operators and they tend to opt to follow the Malaysian National Wage Act 1960. This is the lowest cost solution for hotel operators who rely on this Act to pay low contributions to the Employee Provident Fund (EPF) Agency (equivalent to superannuation). As one expert put it, there is both confusion and a lack of understanding about how best to tackle this problem:

… we have a problem agreeing to the mechanism under the Minimum Wage Act because other payments like service charge, are not counted as wages, but in the Employment Act, the definition of wages states that any payment other than salary, is also counted as wages, so you must treat service points as a wage. This means that service charge from your salary is counted as wages but under the Employment Act other payments must be excluded. So the Minimum Wage Act and the Employment Act are conflicting … (Expert 5).

The expert went on to explain that “…the implementation would have a lot of complications for various entities in the business, however, the development is seen to be positive because we want the industry to be a prosperous industry for Malaysia as well as for hotel owners …” (Expert 5).

Several respondents noted the Government’s intention to introduce a minimum wage for hotel employees was a good strategy; however, there are stakeholders that are not happy with
this decision. One reason for this was that the Employee Provident Fund (EPF), which is a pension scheme, requires a percentage of salary be paid in to the fund by employers for their employees. By using salary only, without service charge to calculate this, the contribution for each employee is lower. This benefits the employer but leaves the employee with little to look forward to in retirement. This is a major issue, according to one expert who stated that:

The Ministries are very concerned about this issue, because even though you take home MYR 2000 including points, your salary slip will only show MYR 400 and a low contribution to EPF ... (Expert 8).

When commenting on the issue of a minimum wage, the majority of experts agreed that its introduction is inevitable and most felt that it should be implemented as soon as possible. This should be done, it was explained, to attract the best talent to work in the hotel sector and this would also reduce reliance on foreign workers that are currently imported to fill employee shortages. One of the experts also suggested that the service for front of house tasks should only be delivered by locals.

Demands of the job, was another key theme associated with both compensation and the ability to provide high quality service. As one expert succinctly put it “... because they are on their feet twenty four seven, you can‘t be expecting them to give the service if there are not compensated …” (Expert 1). Thus, it this expert’s opinion that excessive workloads are detrimental to improving service quality. Clearly then the notion of happy staff making customers happy is not currently practiced in Malaysia, at least not in the view of this respondent.

Several experts felt that because employee’s basic needs were not being met, they could not deliver high quality service. Expert 1 explained this by contrasting the situation in Malaysia with service employees working on cruise ships stating that: :

… comparatively when you look to the western service worker working on a cruise that employ 648 employees on board for example, when guests talk to one of them the service provider keeps on providing good service and is polite all the time. The main reason why they behave like that is because they are being put in a comfortable place. They don’t have to worry about their well-being, they just concentrate on their job. This could happen in the Malaysian Hotel Industry Scenario … (Expert 1).

Another expert held a similar view and highlighted the issue by referring to Malsow’s Hierarchy of Needs advising that:

… even though you train the employee, if they are not compensated well, the training program does not make any sense, as when you look at the fundamental of Abraham Maslow’s hierarchy of needs, I know it is an old theory, but I strongly believe that that theory can also be applied here in Malaysia. When someone’s physiological needs are not fulfilled, how could you move to another level of your life. So, in relation to that, how can someone, I mean hotel employees, give more to their company (hotel operators) if their basic needs are not fulfilled? To fulfil their needs, someone is heavily relying on monetary resources to fulfil their needs and wants, for
example, shelter, food and drink, sleep, or we can say as the basic needs to live in this world … (Expert 7).

One of the proposed strategies to deal with the lack of interest among employees in the hotels sector is to listen to hotel employees demands, one expert asserted. He explained that:

… the hotel industry in Malaysia is unregulated in terms of compensation. My deepest opinion is that hoteliers should listen to the demands of hotel employees. The main factor which leads hospitality and tourism graduates deciding not to work in hotels or work in hotels, but abroad [i.e. in other countries] are heavily due to the issue of compensation, which is salary and other fringe benefits … (Expert 2).

He added that other industries in Malaysia that have good compensation systems, when compared to the hotel industry, do not have issues of labour shortages or a shortage of skilled labour. He cited the following examples adding that:

… accounting, finance and information technology (IT) graduates enjoy good compensation, however, hospitality graduates are basically paid low salaries …. [This is odd because the hospitality and tourism industry is a booming sector contributing the second highest contribution to the Malaysian economy. How ironic the situation … (Expert 2).

While reviewing the dimensions of the proposed model one of the experts contended that improving training and development programs as well as revising the direct and indirect compensation systems is important to improve service delivery. He commented that:

… I believe that all elements suggested by you are crucial to the improvement of the service, but for me I would like to stress that … the pay system falls under the umbrella of direct and indirect compensation … (Expert 2).

He reiterated that happy employees would certainly make customers happy and to support that contention he reported that:

… what is important right now, if the employee is happy, the customer will be happy too. If you are taking care of your staff, definitely you staff will take care of your business, that’s for sure and they will provide better service to the customers and as a result the chances of the guest coming back for another stay will be high … (Expert 2).

In addition, repeat customers could be created and “… if somebody is happy with their company and job, definitely they wouldn’t mind to do extra work for the company …” (Expert 2).

The expert asserted that it was critical to come up with a solution to this as a means to maintain industry competitiveness. Compared to other countries Malaysia, in his opinion is being left behind. The expert commented that:
… when we compare the scenario with Australia, Britain and most major
cities in Europe, many hotel employees work in one hotel for 20 years or
more because they are paid very good money and their welfare is being
taken care of. But in the Malaysian scenario it is different. The hotels push
the employees to give 100 per cent commitment but their remuneration and
welfare are not been taken care of. So I think this is the root cause of the
problem … (Expert 7).

The expert further explained that:

… so if you look at this example, do you think our graduates will work in
hotels? As a result, how are we going to improve the service in hotels if we
keep on losing graduates that are fully trained by the hotel schools? The
problem is rooted in the failure of Human Resource Practice by hotel
operators. There are other instances of hospitality graduates taking jobs in
the telecommunications industry. They have been offered MYR 1800 in
salary, MYR 11 transport allowance every day, a shift allowance of MYR
20 a day, a mobile phone allowance of MYR 300 a month and performance
allowances of MYR 500 a month. So how can the hotel industry compete
with this kind of package offered by other industries … (Expert 7).

These other industries were perceived to have exceptionally competitive compensation
package and to have taken every effort to attract the best talent available in the country.

Expert eight further submitted that the majority of hotel employees are not happy with the
salary they receive, adding that the room rates offered by the Malaysian Hotel Operators are
considered to be among the cheapest in the region and this was why employees were not well
paid. As he pointed out “… room rates are cheap, if the rates are cheap definitely the revenue
will be not so high, so how are we going to attract good employees to work with us when we
can’t afford to pay them good money…” (Expert 8).

The expert further explained that:

… when you look at the banking industry, you probably get MYR 1600 or
MYR 1800, and here because of service charge and the salary, if the room
rates are higher, the take home pay will be higher, because the starting
salary is MYR 350 then you get 3 points, normally in a 5 star hotel 1 point
can be MYR 350 times 3 is already MYR 1050, plus MYR 350 [basic
salary] is already MYR 1400 … (Expert 8).

In discussing the topic of training and development as well as hotel employee’s career
development, it was found that the majority of experts agreed that training is a critical factor
in improving service delivery. Almost all of the experts asserted that, in order to have
excellent service, hotel employees must be trained and that they should be equipped with the
right tools to execute service related tasks. It was claimed by one expert that “…most
managers neglect the need for training as many of them do not have time to train their staff
…” (Expert 3). He further argued, if there is no training, or inadequate training, hotels could
not improve service delivery.
Although this was one view, the issue of ongoing training featured heavily in the interviews and one of the experts captured the general view of respondents arguing that training and continuous learning could assist in improving service delivery. One of the experts also asserted that training programs should be tailored to the needs and wants of customers. By this was meant that it is important for hotel operators to equip their employees with current knowledge and skills in order to serve international guests. One example presented was to train employees to handle the increasing number of disabled and senior citizens that are currently accessing tourism in Malaysia.

Career development was another theme within the realm of training and development. The majority of experts agreed that hotel employees’ career development should be well-planned as they asserted that career advancement was one of the most motivating factors for employees in Malaysia. Career path development was proposed by these respondents to have the capacity to reduce turnover rates among hotel employees in Malaysia because it was claimed that if employees were provided with a career development plan they would be able to work to the plan, develop their future careers and improve their job security.

In developing career pathways, two experts postulated that a management trainee program should be introduced. Such a program would provide hotel employees with adequate training in various departments within a hotel for a defined period of time. To further improve the program, hotel employees should have the opportunity to undergo international cross cultural exposure training. However it was recognised that this type of training could only be afforded by International Chain Hotels with a network of hotels in other countries.

Conclusions and implications

The research uncovered that there are significant issues for the Malaysian Hotel industry to overcome in order to develop satisfied employees who would then deliver services at appropriate standards to meet the expectations of hotel guests. Major issues were the working environment, including the demands of the job and working hours. Employee turnover was also seen to be a significant problem and this is consistent with the findings of Hemdi’s (2005) study in Malaysia which found an unacceptably high number of hotel employees intended to leave their employment seeking better working conditions within other hotels or in other industries. Respondents’ comments on training and development would also seem to suggest that workers are not being empowered within their current roles, which also has an influence on employee satisfaction and employee turnover intentions (Lashley 1996; Spreitzer, 2005). Most important, however, was the issue of employee remuneration which has a marked influence on recruitment, employee turnover and the delivery of quality service standards. It is important to recognise, however, that this was the perspective of a small, albeit expert group and that there are other perspectives that could present a fuller picture of current issues within the Malaysian Hotel context. As a result, further research is recommended to explore the issue from the perspective of employees.

References


